

Handout #1
8/24/2004 Wednesday

The third argument against Polus at *Gorgias* 476a-479e

1. A wrongdoer's paying what is due is the greatest of evils. [476a = Polus' claim at 472d-e]
2. Paying what is due and being justly disciplined for wrongdoing are the same. [476a]
3. All just things are admirable. [476b]
4. If somebody acts upon something, there's necessarily also something that has something done to it by the one acting upon it.
e.g., if someone hits, something is being hit.
5. In whatever way the thing acting upon something acts upon it, the thing acted upon is acted upon in just that way. [476d]
e.g., if someone hits quickly, something is being hit quickly.
6. Paying what is due is a case of being acted upon by one disciplining. [476e]
7. One who disciplines correctly disciplines justly. [476e]
8. The one being disciplined and paying what is due is being acted upon justly. (by 4, 5)
9. The person being punished is having admirable things done to him. [476e] (by 3)
10. What's admirable is either pleasant or beneficial. (see 475a, from the previous argument)
11. [Obviously, being punished is not pleasant.]

Therefore,

12. The person being punished is having good, beneficial things being done to him. [477a]
13. The benefit consists of getting rid of something bad, a kind of corruption in one. [477a]
14. The three worst states of corruption are poverty, disease, and injustice. And the craft in charge of getting rid of the last harm is that of judges.
15. Therefore, the happiest person is the one who never had such corruption. The next happiest is the one who gets rid of it. And the worst off is the one who avoids punishment and therefore remains in a state of corruption, like Archelaus. [478de] [not-1]